<div align="center">

2.4 CHECKLIST
REVIEW AND STRENGTHEN THE ECE SECTION(S) OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR ANALYSIS (ESA) REPORT

</div>

How to use this Checklist

This checklist's questions and items helps you outline and/or review your draft of the ECE chapter(s) of your ESA to identify and ensure that key information is comprehensively included and synthesized in the ESA report.

The checklist's categories and items are organized according to the building blocks of the *Build to Last* conceptual framework.[1] Items have been adapted and built upon from MOOC Module 3 pages 3-46.

Respond "Yes," "Somewhat," or "No" to each item. Based on your responses, suggestions on how to strengthen ECE components of your ESA are proposed.

While filling the checklist, you may see how the ECE content (highlighted text) is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA Report. When viewing the report, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow.

Checklist of Key Questions for Strengthening ECE in the ESA

NATIONAL CONTEXT AND ENABLING ENVIRONMENT FOR ECE

> Please see how this is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report. When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow:
>
> - Chapter 1. Context and Structure (p. 16)

Are the following included and analyzed in detail in the ECE chapter(s) of the ESA?

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
1. The main political and administrative features of the country			

2. The state and evolution of socioeconomic and demographic indicators likely to affect pre-primary education, including:
   ○ **The pre-primary population;**
   ○ **Economic activity and trends, growth;**
   ○ **Adult literacy and employment**			

3. Specific vulnerabilities (natural and/or human-made hazards, social conflicts) that have the potential to disrupt education which have been described,			

---

[1] The Build to Last conceptual framework describes the key building blocks of an effective pre-primary subsector. These building blocks are: (1) an enabling environment; and (2) five core functions. For more information, please see Tool 1.2.

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
including how they may affect the pre-primary subsector in particular			
4. The education system, and the pre-primary subsector in particular, response to linguistic, ethnic, cultural or social diversity			
5. The rate that the general population has been growing, or migrating, recently which consider related challenges for the development of schooling, including pre-primary education			
6. The proportion of the population living in urban settings, if this includes how the population is distributed across the national territory, how education services are organized and affected, in particular pre-primary services			
7. The proportion of the population living in poverty, including groups which are particularly affected			
8. The health and developmental status of pre-primary age children, including global health, nutrition and child development indicators, disaggregated by sex, age and vulnerability characteristics (i.e. children with disabilities, from linguistic or ethnic minority groups, internally displaced children, immigrants, or refugee children) [2]			
9. The history and background of pre-primary education provision in the country, including a clear description of the pre-primary service areas, delivery approaches (public, private and community-based) and program boundaries (e.g. alignment with daycare centers). Depending on context, this could include how the education sector is featured in a broader ECD multisectoral context			
10. The political and institutional environment for (pre-primary) education, including:			

---

[2] Disadvantaged, marginalized and vulnerable young children and families are those that are socially and/or economically excluded in their communities due to vulnerability characteristics such as gender, geographic location (i.e. remoteness), disability status, orphanhood status, household wealth, household arrangements such as single headed households, being from a minority group (i.e. ethnic or linguistic minorities), and/or affected by conflict and crisis (i.e. migrants, immigrants, internally displaced persons, or refugees).

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No

o **The policies and strategies and regulatory frameworks including details on:**
     • **Whether pre-primary is part of compulsory education and if so, from what age;**
     • **whether pre-primary education is provided free of charge, and if so, from what age and for which populations (including extent to which free services are mandated for various vulnerable pre-primary age children such as ethnic and linguistic groups, children with disabilities, displaced, immigrant and/or refugee children);**
   o **The legal framework, sector coordination and monitoring and quality assurance mechanisms at the national level;**
   o **The pre-primary governing structures at central and decentralized levels, including details on:**
     • **whether there is a recognized/legitimate ministerial anchor in charge of promoting pre-primary education;**
     • **whether the roles and responsibilities of the ECE leadership clearly defined and represented in the organizational structure of the ministerial anchor;**
     • **whether ECE is overseen by a separate directorate or hosted within general education or primary education**			

11. **The status of demand for pre-primary education services, including amongst vulnerable groups (i.e. persons with disabilities, ethnic and linguistic minorities, immigrants, refugees, and internally displaced persons)**			
12. **The implications on special support needed to promote vulnerable populations' participation in education, particularly pre-primary**			

• **You answered "Yes" to all items in this section. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA!**

• **You answered "Yes" to a majority of items. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA! For items which you answered somewhat or no to, below are some ideas for strengthening ECE in your ESA.**

PLANNING AND BUDGETING

On access & **on equity:**

Please see how this is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report. When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow:

- On access: Access to preschool education (p. 30-35)

- On equity: Children out of school/not attending school (p. 45-47)

- On cost and financing: Funding in preschool education (p. 103-111)

Are the following details to understand what the pre-primary supply and demand landscape looks like included and analyzed in detail in the ECE chapter(s) in the ESA?

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
1. The absolute **number of children enrolled** in pre-primary education			
2. The **gross and net enrolment ratios and related growth rates/trends** of children per year of pre-primary education (e.g. 5- year olds), disaggregated by district/province, geographical zone, gender and other vulnerability characteristics (linguistic and ethnic minority groups, disability, household wealth, refugee, immigrant, or displaced person, etc.).			
3. The trends/growth rates in number of pre-primary service providers and driving factors of pre-primary availability (i.e. public or private provision)			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
4. The total **number of pre-primary schools/centres and classrooms** in the country, per service provider type, location, etc. o **Of these, which percentage of classrooms are inclusive?**			
5. Analytic narrative on the reasons behind successful retention of pupils or the drop-out of pupils			
6. The total number of pre-school aged children who are not attending school, or who are **out of school**, including a **supply/demand analysis**			

7. Analytic narrative on the extent to which vulnerable sub-groups have equal opportunities to access and benefit from early childhood education, including:
 o How many children (of the right age) attend and participate in pre-primary education, including children with disabilities and children with other vulnerability characteristics (linguistic and ethnic minority groups, disability, household wealth, refugee, immigrant, or displaced person, etc.).
 o How does (lack of) access to ECE differ for the below sub-groups of children (disaggregated data and trend analysis are key to include)?
  • **Gender:** Do girls and boys have equitable opportunities to access pre-primary education? If not, what are gendered barriers to equitable pre-primary education?
  • **(Dis)ability status:** Do children with a disability (e.g. hearing impairment) have equitable access to pre-primary education? What are barriers?
  • **Other vulnerability characteristics such as Ethnic/Minority groups or other children affected by conflict or crises (internally displaced persons, immigrants, refugees, etc.):** Do children with these characteristics have access to pre-primary education?
  • **Geography/Area of residence:** To what extent do children from remote or rural areas have access to pre-primary education as compared to children in urban centers? Example: Do children			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
from all sub-national regions have equitable chances of accessing pre-primary education? • **Household composition:** Do (single or double) orphans have equitable access to pre-primary education? • **Household income/wealth:** Do children from lower socioeconomic classes have equitable access to pre-primary education as children from wealthy households? • **Parents' level of education:** Do children from parents with no/limited education have equitable access to pre-primary education as children from educated parents? • **Aggregate:** which sub-group of children with a combined vulnerability profile (e.g. girls from poor families in rural areas) are most at risk and why? • **How does the quality (learning outcomes, infrastructure, materials) differ for these sub-groups of children? Is data disaggregated and findings Are any inequities related to the pre-primary workforce described and analysed?**			
8. Which interventions, programmes or other initiatives have been taken to address existing inequities? What are their results and what can be improved going forward? o **Mechanisms to promote equitable pre-primary access available** o **Mechanisms to increase family engagement to promote access**			

• **You answered "Yes" to all items in this section. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA!**

• **You answered "Yes" to a majority of items. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA! For items which you answered somewhat or no to, below are some ideas for strengthening ECE in your ESA.**

• **You answered "Somewhat" or "No" to one or more items. Here are some ideas for strengthening:**

1. See **MOOC Module 3** (pages 23-24) which outlines the guiding questions and analytical considerations to support the narrative around access to ECE and extent to which ECE services are equitable.

2. Check the following tools to see if you have available data in your context on access and equity:

   ○ **Tool 2.1 ECE Data Mapping and Evidence Plan Spreadsheet** whereby you may filter by indicators on "Access and Equity" and/or by Core Function (Core Function 1: Planning/Budgeting and Core Function 2: Curriculum Development and Implementation, Pre-Primary School/Classroom). The priority indicators on access and equity are featured here;
   ○ **Tool 2.2: Pre-primary Subsector Analysis Tool**'s Module 1 and equity-related questions across all modules.

3. If the data is unavailable in your context, consider:

   ○ adding this to or establishing an evidence plan using **Tool 2.1**;
   ○ feeding the information into this ESA's ECE chapter(s) findings as areas with limited to no information; and/or
   ○ integrating this information into the ESA recommendations and conclusions section as an area for future enhancement.

On cost and financing:

Are the following cost and financing considerations analyzed and presented?

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
1. The government's budget allocated and released towards pre-primary education, including the recurrent and capital budget. This information could be compared to other subsectors and similar contexts which may also be useful for advocacy and policy priority selection.			
2. An analysis of the level **of public and private financing** (households, communities or other organisations) of pre-primary education and cost-sharing mechanisms among the subsector's players. ○ Note: Equity issues should also be emphasized here. If families are required to subsidize pre-primary education through cash or in-kind contributions either as per policy or in-practice, implications on the poorest households in relation to children's access to pre-primary education should be analyzed and reported.			
3. The level of the **unit costs** of pre-primary services and interventions: ○ Analyze the relative importance of each of the main factors affecting the pre-primary unit cost			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
(e.g., average teacher salary, PTR, percentage of recurrent expenses other than teaching salaries) and their evolution over years. ○ Describe how pre-primary public unit costs decomposition compare with those of other subsectors. ○ Describe how the decomposition of the unit cost informs efficient service delivery of ECE moving forward			
4. An analysis of the evolution of the pre-primary budget and the distribution of resources, by source and service (education, health and other social spending).			

• **You answered "Yes" to all items in this section. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA!**

• **You answered "Yes" to a majority of items. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA! For items which you answered somewhat or no to, below are some ideas for strengthening ECE in your ESA.**

• **You answered "Somewhat" or "No" to one or more items. Here are some ideas for strengthening:**

1. See **MOOC Module 3** (pages 36-40) which outlines the guiding questions and analytical considerations to support the narrative around ECE cost and financing.

2. Check the following tools to see if you have available data in your context on access and equity:

   ○ **Tool 2.1: ECE Data Mapping and Evidence Plan Spreadsheet** whereby you may filter by indicators on by Core Function (Core Function 1: Planning/Budgeting / Cost/Financing;
   ○ **Tool 2.2: Pre-primary Subsector Analysis Tool**'s Module 1 section on Planning and Budgeting.

3. If the data is unavailable in your context, consider:

   ○ adding this to or establishing an evidence plan using **Tool 2.1**;
   ○ feeding the information into this ESA's ECE chapter(s) findings as areas with limited to no information; and/or
   ○ integrating this information into the ESA recommendations and conclusions section as an area for future enhancement.

QUALITY OF PRE-PRIMARY EDUCATION

What is known about the quality of pre-primary education, in terms of learning outcomes, curriculum availability and implementation, ECE workforce and professional development, ECE quality assurance and accountability mechanisms, and family and community engagement?

To respond to the above in the narrative, are following items considered and analyzed?

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
Learning Outcomes and Curriculum Availability and Implementation			
Please see how this is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report. When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow: Learning outcomes – Preschool level (p. 48-51)			
1. What is known about the quality of pre-primary education, in terms of:			
o **Learning outcomes: An analysis of the immediate or later impact of pre-primary education on the early learning and holistic development of young children, including transition rates to primary or basic education, young children's school readiness competencies including early literacy and numeracy skills and physical and socioemotional development**			
o **Learning environment: Availability and quality of pre-primary infrastructure, furniture and teaching and learning materials (including indoor and outdoor play materials) as well as infrastructural guidelines or requirements**			
o **Data: The availability, quality and uptake of pre-primary education data, statistics and evidence for planning.** **Analyze here the extent to which pre-primary data is available from EMIS, research studies, monitoring data, sectoral data, and multisectoral efforts.** **It is important to understand the extent to which data on structural and process quality is available (structural quality may be defined as group size, child-to-teacher ratio, or teachers' qualifications and process quality refers to children's peer to peer and peer to teacher interactions, availability and use of materials, etc.)**			
o **Standards: Early Learning and/or Development Standards: The availability, quality, implementation and monitoring**			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
o **Curriculum:** availability, implementation and monitoring of a pre-primary curriculum across different service providers in the country • Information on the type of curriculum (play-based or competency-based), the structure/content, the intended age group and the materials developed to support the implementation of the curriculum, official or mandatory curriculum framework for pre-primary education • Curriculum used by different types of service providers (public, private, NGOs, etc.) in practice to ensure even levels of quality – including the percentage of pre-primary settings use the official curriculum • Information on the curriculum in terms of inclusivity, gender-responsiveness, cultural relevance, age-appropriateness alignment with early learning development standards (if they exist), continuity with the primary curriculum (to favor smooth transition to primary school) • Availability of the curriculum and related teaching and learning materials in the national language and mother tongue or minority languages • Accompaniment of the curriculum by appropriate and stimulating learning and play materials and availability of these materials in schools and classrooms, by service provider type • Whether or not the curriculum play-based and provides opportunities for all forms of guided exploration and play • If teachers or service providers have been trained to implement the curriculum and monitor and assess students' learning outcomes based on curriculum implementation • Information on the implementation strategy and process to date, including classroom observations on the pedagogy used • Analytic narrative on factors influencing/impeding the full implementation of the curriculum			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
ECE Workforce and Development			
Please see how this is reflected/addressed in [Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report](). When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow: • Teaching workforce – Preschool level (p. 63-65) • Teacher qualifications (p. 69-70) • Teacher development and management (p. 121-131)			
2. Teachers or caregivers: Availability and deployment of motivated, qualified pre-primary teachers:			
o **The proportion of qualified pre-primary teachers (male and female), caregivers or volunteers and how this compares with other subsectors** • **Availability of job profiles and staff qualifications for service providers (teachers, caregivers, assistants, volunteers)**			
o **The number of pre-primary teachers employed per institution type, disaggregated per gender, location, and qualification level**			
o **Analysis of the trend in the pre-primary student-teacher and/or teacher-school ratio, at national and district levels**			
o **Analysis of the accountability systems for ensuring quality of workforce, at central and decentralized levels**			
o **Analysis of the training and development programs for pre-primary teachers, including publicly and privately provided pre- and in-service teacher training programmes, and alignment between the pre-primary curriculum and the teachers' training curriculum** • **Description of who provides training and pedagogical support to pre-primary teachers** • **Description of types of pre-service or in-service training required** • **Inclusion disparities in training participation (gender, disability, wealth**			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
status, linguistic or ethnic minorities, refugee teachers or teachers in crisis contexts) • **Extent to which training is accessible and inclusive (gender-responsive, inclusive of persons with disabilities, persons with disabilities, refugees, minority groups)**			
o **Analysis of the compensation or salary structure for pre-primary teachers and caregivers, compared to the average income in the country/GDP and compared to other levels countries with a similar profile**			
o **Analysis of proportion of pre-primary staff (teachers, assistants, caregivers, etc.) on government payroll to understand implications of the government's ability to employ and retain qualified, publicly funded teachers for pre-primary institutions**			
o **Description and analysis of the career structure for pre-school teachers, if any**			
o **Analysis of the qualifications of pre-primary leaders (male and female principals, directors, etc.) with regards to types of specialized ECE training undertaken and capacity**			

ECE Quality Assurance and Accountability Mechanisms

Please see how this is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report. When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow:

- Quality assessment and assurance (p. 131-135)

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
3. Monitoring and Quality assurance: How are pre-primary centers/ kindergartens/ nurseries monitored and supported)			
o **The existence and quality of pre-primary monitoring standards, tools and processes**			

Checklist item	Yes	Somewhat	No
o **Analysis of whether service quality standards are applicable across all providers (with adaptations as needed)**			
o **Extent to which norms and standards enforced and by whom (responsible institution)**			
o **Analysis of whether ECE quality assurance is based on inspection or certification/accreditation**			
o **Analysis of the availability of ECE program monitoring and evaluation** • **Extent to which M&E is inclusive of monitoring of child development or learning outcomes** • **Extent to which there are sufficient human and financial resources to support ongoing M&E**			
Family and Community Engagement			
4. Parental and community engagement in pre-primary engagement: Availability, implementation and monitoring of a strategy to involve parents and communities in the early education and development of their child			
o **Level of engagement of families in supporting children's learning and development at home**			
o **Equal treatment between girls and boys within the family, particularly in terms of pre-primary education access and attention from caregivers for stimulation and development within the home**			
o **Existence of interventions that seek to encourage family support for children's learning and development at home**			

• **You answered "Yes" to all items in this section. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA!**

- You answered "Yes" to a majority of items. Congratulations, this section appears to be strong in your ESA! For items which you answered somewhat or no to, below are some ideas for strengthening ECE in your ESA.

- You answered "Somewhat" or "No" to one or more items. Here are some ideas for strengthening:

   1. See **MOOC Module 3** (pages 25-35) which outlines the analytical considerations to support the narrative around quality of ECE including: curriculum implementation; workforce development; family and community engagement; and quality assurance.

   2. Check the following tools to see if you have available data in your context on access and equity:

      o **Tool 2.1: ECE Data Mapping and Evidence Plan Spreadsheet**, whereby you may filter by indicators by Core Function (Core Functions 2, 3, 4 and 5)
      o **Tool 2.2: Pre-primary Subsector Analysis Tool**'s Modules 2, 3, 4 and 5.
         - **Module 2: Curriculum Implementation**
         - **Module 3: Workforce Development**
         - **Module 4: Family and Community Engagement**
         - **Module 5: Quality Assurance**

   3. If the data is unavailable in your context, consider:

      o adding this to or establishing an evidence plan using **Tool 2.1**;
      o feeding the information into this ESA's ECE chapter(s) findings as areas with limited to no information; and/or
      o integrating this information into the ESA recommendations and conclusions section as an area for future enhancement.

Conclusions and recommendations

Please see how this is reflected/addressed in Kyrgyzstan's 2018 ESA report. When viewing the report sections indicated below, ECE-specific content is highlighted in yellow:

- Summary of key issues in education: SDG 4.2 Pre-primary education

- Chapter 6: Cross-cutting priorities

- Chapter 7: Strategic choices for the government to improve education

In the overall ESA report, this is a summary of the strengths and weaknesses across the country's education sector, including the key challenges of the pre-primary sub-sector and opportunities for subsector enhancement. Here, policy priorities are identified. These priorities will inform the development of the strategies and activities of the Education Sector Plan and its operational plan.

You may use the other sections of this checklist to identify strategies and areas for enhancement to highlight in this section of the ESA report, as well as ways the subsector strategies contribute to system-wide priorities and goals.

The following are questions that may be analyzed to adequately frame your ECE narrative for this section of the ESA report:

- Have the main ECE problems/issues been identified and succinctly summarized?

- Do the identified ECE problems/issues align with or substantially differ from the broader education sector issues? If they differ, why?

- Which ECE problems/issues may need attention and emphasis in the conclusion, which other subsectors may not need to address? For example, if equitable, quality access is not an issue across other subsectors because they have been historically prioritized, equitable, quality ECE access may need to be pulled out as a subsector issue, rather than a system-wide concern.

- Have the emerging ECE subsector priorities been identified and summarized (i.e. priorities which emerged with consensus from using the Pre-Primary Subsector Analysis Tool. For more information on selecting priorities, refer to the MOOC Module 4 pages 8-10 on selecting priorities. These pages include priority-setting considerations including but not limited to provision modalities, equity, and quality).

- Have initial strategies[3] been identified to achieve ECE priorities? If so, provide reference to the source here, such as the report with consultation workshop findings.

- How do ECE priorities and related strategies align and "fit" within broader education system strategic choices? There is strategic value in showing strong alignment between subsector priorities and strategies and long-term education system priorities and desired outcomes (e.g. "improving school readiness through expanding equitable pre-primary education opportunities and access is likely to improve early grade transition and retention because of x,y, and z contextual factors and evidence").

---

[3] In the ESA report, an initial selection of strategies may be included, which will be further validated and refined during the ESP development phase (see Section 3 of the toolkit).